

North Yorkshire County Council

Business and Environmental Services

Executive Members

21 February 2019

Smart Parking in Harrogate Trial Extension

Report of the Assistant Director – Highways and Transportation

This report contains information of the type defined in paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A Local Government Act 1972 (as amended).

1.0 Purpose of Report

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to provide an update on the performance of the Smart Parking (AppyWay) trial to date and seek approval for a 12 month extension of the trial at a cost of £7,500 to be funded through the Civil Parking Enforcement surplus.

2.0 Background

- 2.1 On 20 April 2018, the Corporate Director of Business and Environmental Services (BES) in consultation with BES Executive Members approved an 18 month pilot of smart parking in Harrogate Town in partnership with Harrogate Borough Council (HBC).
- 2.2 The opportunity for the trial had arisen through the Visa Innovation Competition Fund to showcase cutting edge parking guidance and frictionless parking payments. The capital cost of the required infrastructure (2,000+ sensors and installation worth circa £230k) was funded by Visa in collaboration with AppyWay (previously AppyParking). The County Council and HBC entered in to a tri parte agreement with the supplier of the services, namely Yellow Line Parking Limited trading as AppyWay.
- 2.3 The 18 month pilot went live on 28 January 2019, at which point Harrogate was the first town/city in the UK to have an end-to-end smart parking system (encompassing bay occupancy identification/navigation and 'one click' payments).

3.0 Take up and Performance

- 3.1 Take up of smart parking has been above target, with 9% of all paid parking sessions conducted via the associated mobile app. However this has plateaued in recent months; attributed to the seasonal influx in tourist parking combined with the removal of temporary promotional signage. Sessions are, however, expected to increase following:
- A reduction in the AppyWay convenience fee from 30p to 20p;
 - A planned paid-for digital promotion by AppyWay; and
 - Mobile app enhancements.
- 3.2 A number of performance measures have been established to evaluate the project. Further work is required to refine these measures and obtain more feedback from

customers. Other factors impact several indicators so officers are still identifying what can be clearly allocated to the trial. In the meantime, circa 500 users have been surveyed. Of these users:

- 39% stay longer in Harrogate Town as a result of not worrying about a pay and display (P&D) ticket expiring;
- 21% have saved time finding a car parking space – further work is required to translate this into CO2 saved;
- 66% of users say that using Appy alleviates stress normally associated with a P&D ticket expiring; and
- 89% say that Appy is more convenient than using a P&D machine.

3.3 In addition to the above performance:

- Appy sessions are on average six minutes longer on-street and 23 minutes longer off-street than P&D payment sessions. Although this could be interpreted as serving to increase revenue, it must be balanced against the impact of linear 'minute-by-minute' pricing (customers not 'overpaying') and the underlying, ongoing decline in parking usage. Further work will take place to establish revenue impact.
- To date, the councils have saved circa £5,400 on pay and display machine transaction costs (at 12p per card transaction over 45,000 transactions). This is forecast to reach £44,400 over the proposed extension to the contract period, of which £35,400 will be a saving for NYCC (£9,000 for HBC).
- As Appy transactions have increased there has been a proportionate reduction in cash payments, whilst card payments have reduced only marginally. In week 35: Appy +8%, cash -8%, card -1%. This reduces the burden of cash management on HBC and operational costs to NYCC.
- The data provided by Appy has supported a robust evidence base for the on-going parking review; supporting better strategic/operational decision making.
- Appy users, inevitably, are more likely to pay for their full use of a bay. However it is not possible to compare compliance with P&D users.
- There has been international coverage of the smart parking trial and the project has been shortlisted for several accolades, recently winning 'Street of The Future' at the 2019 Transtech Awards.

4.0 Extending the Trial

- 4.1 The current trial period ends on 27 July 2020. However, NYCC/HBC officers have negotiated a proposal to extend the terms by one year (to 28 July 2021).
- 4.2 The proposed extension is due to the performance data available to date not being mature enough to allow a firm decision to be made on whether to make the system permanent on conclusion of the trial. It is considered necessary to extend the trial to recover more detailed analytics of the system over the full 18 month trial period and allow for a full procurement process should it be decided to continue without a break in its service/operation.
- 4.3 The proposed 12 month extension will give the local authorities the opportunity to fully develop/evaluate a business case for any permanent smart parking solution in the district. This will also allow for a meaningful trial of the delayed barrier solution for Jubilee/Victoria Multi Story Car Parks and imminent product developments. Whilst the barrier solution is not an on-street matter the improved off-street offer could have positive traffic management benefits.
- 4.4 As part of the extension, Appy shall also fund the deployment of sensors in selected 'high-demand' disc zones and all disabled bays; allowing the customer to identify

vacant bays. The additional data/insight will further support decision making and traffic management.

- 4.5 There are several system enhancements planned through to March 2020, including:
- A new business intelligence reporting solution that will encompass data from all P&D payment methods to support/inform operational decisions; and
 - The overlay of both Appy and P&D payment data onto AppyWay's new Insights dashboard to significantly improve parking compliance monitoring.
- 4.6 Other applications to be explored include deployment in car club spaces, mobility hubs and retailer/BID involvement.
- 4.7 Should the Corporate Director BES in consultation with BES Executive Members approve the extension of the trial for a further 12 months, the value of the contract shall not exceed the EU procurement threshold of £181,302. The financial modelling at Appendix A (Not for Publication) sets out the value of the contract for the initial 18 month trial and forecasts the additional extension of 12 months. The tables show the forecasted value for both on and off-street transaction fees during the extended contact term in addition to the licence fees. AppyWay have capped their income to avoid reaching the OJEU threshold.

5.0 Conclusions

- 6.1 Early indications are that smart parking is more convenient for the customer, increases dwell time in Harrogate Town Centre and enhances its offer. Furthermore, the data/insight has supported the development of a parking study into the use and demand of parking within the Pay and Display Zone.
- 6.2 The proposed extension to the pilot scheme set out in this report provides a better and more informed decision making process associated with whether to make the scheme permanent.

7.0 Equalities Implications

- 7.1 There are not considered to be any equality implications arising from the extension of the trial. An initial equality impact assessment screening form is presented in Appendix B.

8.0 Financial Implications

- 8.1 The financial implications of extending the trial is the additional cost of £7,500. This funding can be funded from the CPE annual surplus.

9.0 Legal Implications

- 9.1 The Traffic Regulation Order providing for charges in the Pay and Display zone(s) ("the TRO") was previously varied by the (HARROGATE, KNARESBOROUGH, PANNAL AND BURN BRIDGE)(PARKING AND WAITING)(NO 33) MINOR ORDER 2018 to cover the initially anticipated trial period of 18 months expiring at the end of April 2020. As the trial is to effectively be extended by 12 months a further Minor Order will need to be made to cover the additional period. A review will be undertaken in due course about whether permanent variation to the TRO needs to be put in place.

9.2 Contractually, it is necessary for all parties i.e. NYCC, HBC and AppyWay to sign up to the agreed variation.

10.0 Recommendations

- 10.1 It is recommended that the Corporate Director, Business and Environmental Services (BES), in consultation with the BES Executive Members, approves:
- i. The trial of Smart Parking in Harrogate is extended for a further 12 months beyond the initial 18 month period;
 - ii. the expenditure of £7,500 to cover the cost of the extension which will be paid from the CPE surplus.

BARRIE MASON
Assistant Director, Highways and Transportation

Author of Report: David Kirkpatrick

Background Papers:
Smart Parking Trial Reports April and September 2018

Initial equality impact assessment screening form (As of October 2015 this form replaces 'Record of decision not to carry out an EIA')			
This form records an equality screening process to determine the relevance of equality to a proposal, and a decision whether or not a full EIA would be appropriate or proportionate.			
Directorate	Business and Environmental Services		
Service area	Highways and Transportation		
Proposal being screened			
Officer(s) carrying out screening	David Kirkpatrick		
What are you proposing to do?	Extend the existing trial of a Smart Parking (Appy Parking) system in Harrogate for a further 12 months in order to gather further data to inform a decision on whether to make the system permanent or not		
Why are you proposing this? What are the desired outcomes?	Extending the trial will allow for an informed decision to be made on the performance of the system and whether to continue on a permanent basis and if so, allowing time to conclude a full procurement process without a break in service of the system.		
Does the proposal involve a significant commitment or removal of resources? Please give details.	No		
Impact on people with any of the following protected characteristics as defined by the Equality Act 2010, or NYCC's additional agreed characteristic As part of this assessment, please consider the following questions:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To what extent is this service used by particular groups of people with protected characteristics? Does the proposal relate to functions that previous consultation has identified as important? Do different groups have different needs or experiences in the area the proposal relates to? 			
If for any characteristic it is considered that there is likely to be a significant adverse impact or you have ticked 'Don't know/no info available', then a full EIA should be carried out where this is proportionate. You are advised to speak to your Equality rep for advice if you are in any doubt.			
Protected characteristic	Yes	No	Don't know/No info available
Age		No	
Disability		No	
Sex (Gender)		No	
Race		No	
Sexual orientation		No	
Gender reassignment		No	
Religion or belief		No	
Pregnancy or maternity		No	
Marriage or civil partnership		No	

NYCC additional characteristic			
People in rural areas		No	
People on a low income		No	
Carer (unpaid family or friend)		No	
Does the proposal relate to an area where there are known inequalities/probable impacts (e.g. disabled people's access to public transport)? Please give details.	No.		
Will the proposal have a significant effect on how other organisations operate? (e.g. partners, funding criteria, etc.). Do any of these organisations support people with protected characteristics? Please explain why you have reached this conclusion.	No		
Decision (Please tick one option)	EIA not relevant or proportionate:	X	Continue to full EIA:
Reason for decision	To allow an informed decision to be made on the performance of the system and to allow for a full procurement process should it be decided to continue on a permanent basis with the system		
Signed (Assistant Director or equivalent)	<i>Barrie Mason</i>		
Date	<i>13/02/2020</i>		